

**Proposed Rubrics for Recommended New General Education Diversity Categories**

A frequent question during DETF listening sessions about the proposed General Education diversity category changes has been what the expectations would be regarding the new and revised learning outcomes. To offer greater specificity, here are drafts of possible learning outcome assessment rubrics for the new categories, created by DETF members Dr. Ebony Shockley Terrell, an expert in learning outcome assessment, and Dr. Cynthia Stevens, current chair of the General Education Diversity Faculty Board.

**Background on General Education Assessment Rubrics**

During AY2015, the General Education faculty boards developed learning outcome assessment rubrics to aid faculty members who were interested in continuous course improvement. These rubrics were designed to facilitate faculty member reflection regarding which aspects of their courses were and were not achieving General Education learning outcomes. The campus General Education website provides [step-by-step instructions](#) on how to use these rubrics. For more detailed information, please visit the website of the [National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment](#).

**Draft Rubric for Understanding Structures of Racism and Inequality**

The proposed category of Understanding Structures of Racism and Inequality reflects an evolution of the current Understanding Plural Societies category. The major change would be inclusion of a required learning outcome pertaining to racism. For comparison purposes, please see the [current learning outcome rubric for Understanding Plural Societies](#).

**Types of assignments that might be used to assess USRI learning outcomes:** journal entries, portfolios, exhibits, reflections, self-assessment papers, group work, term papers, presentations, blogs, case studies, essay exam answers, etc.

*As a result of completing this USRI General Education course, students will...*

USRI Criterion	Advanced	Proficient	Beginning	Unacceptable
Analyze racism as a form of historical & systemic discrimination in the US or internationally that may intersect with other forms of power & oppression. <i>(proposed required learning outcome)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Identify complex individual &amp; societal dynamics that contribute to bias &amp; unjust outcomes on basis of race.</li> <li>Explain how &amp; why systemic policies &amp; practices undermine group-level outcomes on basis of race.</li> <li>Articulate how individuals' race may fundamentally alter their experiences associated with other diversity dimensions (e.g., gender, age).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Acknowledge multiple sources of racial bias (e.g., individual bias, historically biased laws).</li> <li>Recognize that some policies &amp; practices cause unjust group-level outcomes on basis of race.</li> <li>Identify how individuals' experiences on other diversity dimensions (e.g., gender, age) may interact with their race.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Focus on individual attitudes or preferences as the basis of racism.</li> <li>Acknowledge with prompting that some policies &amp; practices may contribute to disparate racial effects.</li> <li>Observe different patterns in peoples' experiences across different diversity dimensions (e.g., race, gender, age).</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Blame the victim: attribute racial disparities to the actions or decisions of racial minority group members.</li> <li>Deny the role societal forces (e.g., political/legal system) may have in creating disparate outcomes on basis of race.</li> <li>Advocate "color blindness" as a valid societal goal.</li> </ul>
Reflect on & critically analyze one's own identity (such as race, ethnicity, cultural values, norms & biases) and how these affect one's perceptions of individuals with different identities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Articulate insights into norms and biases connected with own social identity (e.g., recognize complexities, aware of how own experiences shape reactions to others).</li> <li>Demonstrate flexibility in evaluating own and others' identity-related norms and biases.</li> <li>Incorporate new insights into description of own social identities; demonstrate a shift in self-description &amp; description of others.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize alternative perspectives that could be applied to norms and biases of own &amp; others' social identities.</li> <li>Reason through complexities offered by different perspectives.</li> <li>Offer an expansive description of own social identities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Outline the norms and biases associated with various dimensions of own social identity.</li> <li>Express preference for norms and biases of others who share the same social identities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Show limited awareness of norms and biases associated with own social identities.</li> <li>Focus on discomfort when considering alternative views of social identity norms &amp; biases.</li> <li>Embrace self-serving interpretations of others who hold different social identities.</li> </ul>

**DRAFT** General Education USRI and NDSE Rubrics

<b>USRI Criterion</b>	<b>Advanced</b>	<b>Proficient</b>	<b>Beginning</b>	<b>Unacceptable</b>
Identify and describe the experiences of individuals who hold different social identities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consistently interpret their own experiences from more than one perspective or worldview</li> <li>Imagine &amp; describe the perspective of others who hold different social identities.</li> <li>Comprehend the limitations of a single worldview or perspective.</li> <li>Empathize and respond supportively when recognizing the experiences, feelings, and dignity of others who have different social identities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sometimes draw on more than one worldview when interpreting experiences of those who have different social identities.</li> <li>Recognize intellectual &amp; emotional dimensions of more than one worldview.</li> <li>Comprehend the limitations of a single worldview or perspective.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Identify a few ways in which those with different social identities may experience situations but respond across situations using own worldview.</li> <li>Recognize that evaluations of others' social identities may be interpreted as criticism.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Fail to identify the value in world views different from their own.</li> <li>View others' experiences through own worldview and identity</li> <li>React defensively when asked to consider perspectives of those with different social identities.</li> </ul>
<p>Analyze:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Social policies, ideologies, or institutions that give rise to structural inequalities</li> <li>Differences among forms &amp; traditions of thought or expression in relation to cultural, historical, political &amp; social contexts</li> <li>Histories, experiences &amp; perspectives of 2+ social groups in a single society or historical framework OR across different societies or historical times</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Consistently distinguish evidence from interpretation.</li> <li>Acknowledge conditions under which assumptions are &amp; are not defensible.</li> <li>Recognize &amp; describe ways that power can be a major factor in intergroup relations.</li> <li>Consistently apply a framework (e.g., intersectional, comparative) to investigate, analyze, or recognize power structures, differences, historical or current practices or policies promoting inequalities.</li> <li>Demonstrate new knowledge (written or verbal) regarding assumptions and biases about self, family, norms, traditions, culture, of other groups and the implications.</li> <li>Express a disposition of care toward a marginalized group as a result of an investigation, assignment, experience, or exercise.</li> <li>Participate in activities inside or outside of class that identify, critique, analyze, or share experiences of disenfranchised groups to adapt, extend, or further commitment to engagement with civic life, or philosophically different, diverse, or essentialized cultures.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sometimes recognize assumptions &amp; their role in modifying conclusions (i.e., does not do so consistently).</li> <li>Recognize that power is present in intergroup relations.</li> <li>Is able to apply an intersectional or comparative framework to understand power structures.</li> <li>Recognize that identity formation is relational across groups.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize that evidence differs from interpretation but show difficulty applying these concepts concretely.</li> <li>Differentiate stronger from weaker reasoning at a gross level when evaluating argument strength.</li> <li>Can give an example of an intersectional, comparative or other type of framework.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Fail to identify logical flaws in reasoning; exhibit logical fallacies in own arguments.</li> <li>Fail to identify ways in which multiple identities might be represented or how they might inform one another.</li> <li>Fail to recognize power as a factor in intergroup relations.</li> </ul>

***Draft Rubric for Navigating Diverse Social Environments***

The proposed category of Navigating Diverse Social Environments reflects an evolution of the current Cultural Competence category. The major change would be broadening of the current required behavioral learning outcome to include a choice of at least one of three possible behavioral learning outcomes. For comparison purposes, please see the [current learning outcome rubric for Cultural Competence](#).

**Types of assignments that might be used to assess NDSE learning outcomes:** journal entries and blogs, team projects (presentations, papers; could include team-level feedback for members), role-play assignments (including peer feedback on role-play skills), self-assessment papers.

DRAFT General Education USRI and NDSE Rubrics

As a result of completing this NDSE General Education course, students will ...

NDSE Criterion	Advanced	Proficient	Beginning	Unacceptable
Reflect on critical similarities & differences between one's own & others' identities & social positions due to racism and/or other systems of oppression	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Articulate insights into norms and biases connected with own social identity (e.g., recognize complexities, aware of how own experiences shape reactions to others).</li> <li>Demonstrate flexibility in evaluating own and others' identity-related norms and biases.</li> <li>Incorporate new insights into description of own social identities; demonstrate a shift in self-description &amp; description of others.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize alternative perspectives that could be applied to norms and biases of own &amp; others' social identities.</li> <li>Reason through complexities offered by different perspectives with curiosity/without distress.</li> <li>Offer an expansive description of own social identities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Outline the norms and biases associated with various dimensions of own social identity</li> <li>Express preference for norms and biases of others who share the same social identities</li> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Show limited awareness of norms and biases associated with own social identities.</li> <li>Focus on discomfort when considering alternative views of social identity norms &amp; biases.</li> <li>Embrace self-serving interpretations of others who hold different social identities.</li> </ul>
Identify, reflect on & demonstrate language & behaviors used to convey respect for other people of similar & different social backgrounds	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize culturally-loaded, insensitive language, why it is problematic &amp; consistently choose respectful language.</li> <li>Consistently treat others with dignity and care.</li> <li>Assert own perspective and elicits others' views to ensure all perspectives are heard.</li> <li>Sensitively &amp; honestly broach topics on which there may be disagreement.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Treat others who are different with formality or politeness.</li> <li>Focus on areas of agreement in discussions.</li> <li>Recognize some forms of culturally loaded or insensitive language.</li> <li>Listen to understand others' views.</li> <li>Avoid raising difficult or challenging topics on which there may be disagreement.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minimize interactions with others who are obviously different from oneself.</li> <li>Use nonverbal behavior denoting discomfort (e.g., minimal eye contact, clipped interactions, closed nonverbal behavior).</li> <li>Listen primarily to respond or counter others' views.</li> <li>Is partially aware of culturally loaded or insensitive language.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Overlook others who are different from self or engages in stereotyping behavior when interacting with them.</li> <li>Is unaware of use of culturally loaded or insensitive language.</li> <li>Actively denigrate others who differ from self.</li> <li>Assert own views or position repetitively.</li> </ul>
Identify and describe the experiences of individuals who hold different social identities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interpret their own experiences from more than one perspective or worldview.</li> <li>Imagine &amp; describe the perspective of others who hold different social identities.</li> <li>Comprehend the limitations of a single worldview or perspective.</li> <li>Empathize and respond supportively when recognizing the experiences, feelings, and dignity of others who have different social identities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize intellectual &amp; emotional dimensions of more than one worldview</li> <li>Comprehend the limitations of a single worldview or perspective</li> <li>Sometimes draw on more than one worldview when interpreting experiences of those who have different social identities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Identify a few ways in which those with different social identities may experience situations, but respond across situations using own worldview</li> <li>Recognize that evaluations of others' social identities may be interpreted as criticism</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>View others' experiences through own worldview and identity.</li> <li>React defensively when asked to consider perspectives of those with different social identities.</li> </ul>
Communicate & collaborate effectively (listen & adapt one's own persuasive arguments) with others from different social backgrounds to establish and build coalitions. <i>(1 of 3 options to meet required behavioral learning outcome)</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Actively seek to collaborate with others who hold different social identities.</li> <li>Recognize common &amp; subtle forms of insensitive verbal/nonverbal language &amp; understand why it is offensive.</li> <li>Participate in dialogue (either written or verbal) that builds consensus or results in shared understanding across social identity differences.</li> <li>Inquire or investigate appropriate language and terms, working to understand the implications of language use in and across communities.</li> <li></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Be willing to interact with others who hold different social identities.</li> <li>Recognize most common forms of insensitive verbal and nonverbal language.</li> <li>Listen to understand points of view of others who hold different social identities.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minimize interactions with others who hold different social identities or interact in stereotypical ways.</li> <li>Be aware of blatant forms of culturally insensitive language.</li> <li>Listen primarily to respond or counter the views of others who hold different social identities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Interact in stereotypical ways with others who hold different social identities.</li> <li>Fail to recognize culturally insensitive language.</li> <li>Ignore or dismiss contributions from others who hold different social identities.</li> </ul>
Demonstrate skills to work collaboratively within and across social	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize <b>and address</b> verbal and nonverbal patterns in how particular social identities are (1) shown undue</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize verbal and nonverbal patterns in how particular social identities are (1) shown undue</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>May recognize when particular social identities have been</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Feel mistrust of others whose social identities differ from their own.</li> </ul>

DRAFT General Education USRI and NDSE Rubrics

NDSE Criterion	Advanced	Proficient	Beginning	Unacceptable
<p>groups to achieve mutual goals. <i>(1 of 3 options to meet required behavioral learning outcome)</i></p>	<p>deference/elevated and (2) dismissed/ignored in small group settings.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Value and work to synthesize contributions of all group members.</li> <li>● Build morale across all members within diverse groups.</li> <li>● Raise and constructively discuss misalignments within the group regarding member expectations and contributions</li> </ul>	<p>deference/elevated and (2) dismissed/ignored in small group settings.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Recognize unique contributions of each group member.</li> <li>● Detect fluctuations in team members' morale.</li> <li>● Recognize misalignments within the group regarding member expectations and contributions;</li> </ul>	<p>dismissed or ignored in small group settings.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Recognize some symptoms of low group morale.</li> <li>● Recognize contributions of members who share own social identity.</li> <li>●</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Equate own feelings about group with group morale.</li> <li>● Dismiss contributions of members who hold social identities different from their own.</li> <li>● Blame other members for misalignments in member expectations and contributions</li> </ul>
<p>Use skills to identify and reach consensus on resolutions for shared problems in conflicts across social groups. <i>(1 of 3 options to meet required behavioral learning outcome)</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Acknowledges own limitations when challenged on cross-cultural interpretations or implicit value judgments.</li> <li>● Listen &amp; ask questions to understand others' perspective when in conflict.</li> <li>● Respond in ways that acknowledge others' perspectives or grievances.</li> <li>● Politely challenge disrespectful actions or uninformed statements.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Withdraw when challenged on cross-cultural interpretations or implicit value judgments.</li> <li>● Defend views or actions and/or exits situation when cross-cultural conflict emerges.</li> <li>● Seek to justify own perspective before inquiring about others' perspective.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● React defensively when challenged on cross-cultural interpretations or implicit value judgments.</li> <li>● Withdraw from emotionally tense discussions OR responds with anger.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● React aggressively when challenged on cross-cultural interpretations or implicit value judgments.</li> <li>● Interrupt or raise voice when interacting with others whose views or perspectives are in conflict.</li> </ul>